## City Council



| Date of meeting:         | 30 January 2023  |
|--------------------------|--|
| Title of Report:         | Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry                          |
| Lead Member:             | Councillor Jonathan Drean (Cabinet Member for Transport) |
| Lead Strategic Director: | Anthony Payne (Strategic Director for Place)             |
| Author:                  | David List, General Manager Tamar Crossing               |
| Contact Email:           | David.list@tamarcrossings.org.uk                         |
| Your Reference:          |  |
| Key Decision:            | No   |
| Confidentiality:         | Part I - Official  |

### **Purpose of Report**

The Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry have historically been operated together as a single undertaking on a 'user-pays' principle funded almost entirely from toll income. The undertaking maintains a contemporary financial model that incorporates income forecasts based on traffic levels. Income at the two crossings had been significantly reduced by the effect of Covid-19 and traffic levels have still not recovered to pre pandemic levels and are now operating at circa 90% of that previously.

This report sets out for consideration and approval, the proposed revenue estimates (budget) for PCC and CC Cabinet and Full Council for 2023/24 and indicative figures for the subsequent three years 2024/25, 2025/26 and 2026/27, together with the proposed capital programme.

The global economy is experiencing changes in consumer patterns, and inflation, at an unprecedented rate. Unforeseen 12 months ago when preparing the Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme Report 2022-2026. The consequences of the economic situation impacts both the income and the expenditure of the Joint Undertaking. The assumptions used to calculate the revenue estimates and proposed capital programme were based on information available to officers at the time of report preparation. However, it is hoped that this level of increase will settle over the 4 year period, to those seen in more recent years.

The full report, with appendices, agreed by the Joint Committee on the 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2022, is attached for reference.

### **Recommendations and Reasons**

That Council approves:

#### OFFICIAL

I. The 2023/24 revenue estimates and capital programme and the draft 2023-24 Business plan, as set out in the appendices to the JC Report, be approved; and

2. The longer-term forecast to 2026/27 is noted.

### Reasons

Without an approved budget, agreed by the parent authorities, PCC and CC, bridge and ferry operations would be unable to operate. An agreed, approved budget is a requirement of the existing governance arrangements of the parent authorities.

### Alternative options considered and rejected

Not to approve the Budget as presented; rejected on the basis that Bridge and Ferry operations need to provide safe crossings 24/7/365, connecting communities, supporting the local and national economy and providing access to healthcare and leisure.

The do nothing option was also rejected; as it would result in the parent authorities not delivering safe crossings or meeting their responsibilities regarding a duty of care.

### Relevance to the Corporate Plan and/or the Plymouth Plan

The Tamar Bridge & Torpoint Ferry links are key gateways to the City and provide opportunities for investment, jobs and growth particularly in the wider context of Plymouth as the regional economic centre.

Providing a safe well-maintained road network contribute to the economic well-being of the City, supporting the Council's Growth priority.

### Financial Risks

The recommendations addresses the safety and operational requirements and reduces associated risk to the parent authorities.

### Carbon Footprint (Environmental) Implications:

Continued service delivery will provide reliable journey times and minimises the potential for congestion or longer diverted journeys and related pollution.

### Other Implications: e.g. Health and Safety, Risk Management, Child Poverty:

\* When considering these proposals members have a responsibility to ensure they give due regard to the Council's duty to promote equality of opportunity, eliminate unlawful discrimination and promote good relations between people who share protected characteristics under the Equalities Act and those who do not.

**Risk Management** – This report addresses the requirement to continue with BAU for these important crossings.

**Health and Safety** – Key Performance Indicators within the Strategic Plan and associated Annual Plans are designed to drive improvement. There are no child poverty or community safety implications.

### Appendices

\*Add rows as required to box below

### PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

| Ref. | Title of Appendix   | <b>Exemption Paragraph Number</b> (if app<br>If some/all of the information is confidential, you must<br>why it is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Sched<br>of the Local Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant |   |   |   |   | i must indica<br>Schedule I |   |
|------|---|---|---|---|---|---|-----------------------------|---|
|      |   | I   | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6                           | 7 |
| A    | Briefing report – Tamar Bridge and Torpoint<br>Ferry 2023/24 Revenue and Capital<br>Programme |   |   |   |   |   |                             |   |
| В    | TBTFJC Report 2 December 2022, 2<br>December 2021   |   |   |   |   |   |                             |   |
|      | Draft Minutes of TBTFJC Meeting,<br>2 December 2021   |   |   |   |   |   |                             |   |

### **Background papers:**

\*Add rows as required to box below

Please list all unpublished, background papers relevant to the decision in the table below. Background papers are <u>unpublished</u> works, relied on to a material extent in preparing the report, which disclose facts or matters on which the report or an important part of the work is based.

| Title of any background paper(s) | Exemption Paragraph Number (if applicable)  |   |   |   |   |   |   |  |
|----------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|--|
|                                  | If some/all of the information is confidential, you must indicate why it<br>is not for publication by virtue of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local<br>Government Act 1972 by ticking the relevant box. |   |   |   |   |   |   |  |
|                                  | I   | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |  |
|                                  |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |  |

### Sign off:

| Fin    | DIN.<br>22.23.<br>321  | Leg | E /38<br>851/1<br>9.12.2<br>2(3) | Mon<br>Off |  | HR |  | Asset<br>s |  | Strat<br>Proc |  |
|--------|--|-----|----------------------------------|------------|--|----|--|------------|--|---------------|--|
| Please | Originating Senior Leadership Team member: Philip Robinson (Service Director for Street Services)<br>Please confirm the Strategic Director(s) has agreed the report? Yes |     |                                  |            |  |    |  |            |  |               |  |
| Date a | Date agreed: 20/12/2022  |     |                                  |            |  |    |  |            |  |               |  |
| Cabine | Cabinet Member approval: Councillor Jonathan Drean, Cabinet Member for Transport   |     |                                  |            |  |    |  |            |  |               |  |
| Date a | Date approved: 05/01/2023  |     |                                  |            |  |    |  |            |  |               |  |

## Appendix A

### Briefing Report -

### Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2023/24 Revenue and Capital Programme

### Introduction

- 1.1 The Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry are operated, maintained and improved jointly by Plymouth City Council and Cornwall Council on a 'user pays' principle, being funded by toll income using powers derived from the Tamar Bridge Act. The finances of the joint undertaking are effectively ring-fenced by the Act, and it is operated in normal times as a self-financing business.
- 1.2 The existing governance requires that both parent authorities agree an annual Budget to facilitate the undertakings as part of the operational delivery remit.
- 1.3 The budget for 2023/24 will meet the requirements of the Councils, in that it is balanced and affordable, even though traffic levels have remained below pre-Covid levels and are currently running at approximately 90% at both crossings, which is line with the 90% level incorporated in the financial model.
- 1.4 Appendix 4 of the TBTF JC Report, 2023/24 Revenue and Capital Programme contains the Annual Business Plan.
- 1.5 The detailed projection to the effect on the undertaking's financial position and the response of TBTFJC is detailed in Section 2 of the TBTFJC Future Financing Report at Appendix B.

### 2. Future Finance issues

2.1 There are concerns however that in the coming years, unless action is taken, there may be a deficit that would require addressing, as seen in the table below;

|                     | 2022/23 | 2023/24 | 2024/25   | 2025/26   | 2026/27   |
|---------------------|---------|---------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Forecast reserve    |         |         |           |           |           |
| surplus / (deficit) |         |         |           |           |           |
| at 31st March       | £0.614m | £0.192m | (£1.140m) | (£1.664m) | (£2.133m) |

2.2 The Tamar Bridge Act 1957 sets out the default process to be followed if such deficits arise, namely that the parent authorities, Cornwall Council and Plymouth City Council cover that deficit for subsequent recovery at some later stage when the undertaking returns to a surplus position.

- 2.3 The primary reasons identified for the projected deficit are interest rate rises, currently circa 10% and energy costs that have risen exponentially.
- 2.4 A 30% toll increase was proposed earlier in 2022 with a request made to the SoS for Transport, this was agreed by the SoS and will be implemented in January 2023. The issues identified in 1.6 were not present when the assessment was made, to set the required Toll increase. The increase agreed by the parent authorities reflected the situation at the time with local authority due diligence regarding projected costs.
- 2.5 The TBTF JC Report (2.16 Reserves) shows the projected deficit issue (Table in 1.3 above) and concern was duly raised by the Joint Committee, who agreed that a Workshop would be held early in 2023, to assess opportunities and options to address the deficits identified.
- 2.6 The Joint Chairmen of TBTFJC and Portfolio Holders of both authorities have continued to lobby government to;

a) Have the ability to apply RPI locally, which will require Primary Legislation and is currently being investigated and

b) For long-term financial support for the Bridge, although this request has been without success to date.

2.7 Resolutions can be found in the draft minutes of the TBTF JC meeting on 2 December 2022 which are attached at Appendix C.

| _  |               |   |                          |  |  |  |  |
|--|---------------|---|--------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Report to:   | int Committee |   |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Date:  |               | 2 <sup>nd</sup> December 2022             |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Title:   |               | 2023-2024 Revenue and Capital             | Programme                |  |  |  |  |
| Portfolio A  | rea:          | Cornwall Council: Transport               |                          |  |  |  |  |
|  |               | Plymouth City Council: Transpo            | ort                      |  |  |  |  |
| Divisions A  | ffected:      | All                                       |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Local Mem<br>briefed:  | ber(s)        | NA  |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Relevant Sc  | rutiny Com    | nittee:                                   |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Cornwall   | Council: Ed   | conomic Growth and Developme              | nt                       |  |  |  |  |
| Plymouth   | City Coun     | cil: Growth and Infrastructure            |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Authors,   | Jamie Wr      | ight, Service Accountant                  |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Roles and  | 01872 3222    | 222 jamie.wright@cornwall.gov.uk          |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Contact<br>Details:  |               | allance, Governance and Finance Manager   |                          |  |  |  |  |
|  | 01752 361     | 57 <u>andrew.vallance@tamarcrossings.</u> | org.uk                   |  |  |  |  |
|  |               |   |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Approval a   | nd clearance  | obtained:                                 | Y / N                    |  |  |  |  |
| Date next s  | steps can be  | taken                                     | 2 <sup>nd</sup> December |  |  |  |  |
|  |               |   | 2022                     |  |  |  |  |
| For Cabin  | et and dele   | egated executive decisions only           |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Key decision? (≥£500k in value or significant effect on <b>N</b> communities in two or more electoral divisions) |               |   |                          |  |  |  |  |
| Published in advance on Cabinet Work Programme? <b>N</b>   |               |   | N                        |  |  |  |  |
| Urgency Pr   | ocedure(s) ι  | used if 'N' to Work Programme?            | N                        |  |  |  |  |

## Appendix B

# Recommendation(s) to the Councils of the Parent Authorities via the Cabinets of the Parent Authorities:

1. That the 2022/23 revenue estimates and capital programme and the draft 2022-23 Business plan, as set out in the appendices to this report, be approved; and

2. the longer term forecast to 2026/27 is noted.

### I Executive Summary

- 1.1 This report sets out for consideration and approval, the proposed revenue estimates (budget) for the Joint Committee for 2023/24 and indicative figures for the subsequent three years 2024/25, 2025/26 and 2026/27, together with the proposed capital programme.
- 1.2 The global economy is experiencing changes in consumer patterns, and inflation, at an unprecedented rate. Unforeseen 12 months ago when preparing the Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme Report 2022-2026. The consequences of the economic situation impacts both the income and the expenditure of the Joint Undertaking. The assumptions used to calculate the revenue estimates and proposed capital programme are based on information currently available to officers. However, it is hoped that this level of increase will settle over the 4 year period, to those seen in more recent years.

### 2 Purpose of Report and key information

2.1 The Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferries (TBTF) are operated, maintained and improved jointly by Plymouth City Council and Cornwall Council on a 'user pays' principle, being funded by toll income using powers derived from the Tamar Bridge Act.

In developing the budgets for 2023/24 to 2026/27 set out within appendix 1, the following inflationary and interest assumptions have been used:

| Rates                 | 2023/24 | 2024/25 | 2025/26 | 2026/27 |
|-----------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
|                       |         |         |         |         |
| Inflation CPI         | 7.5%    | I.80%   | 2.00%   | 2.00%   |
|                       |         |         |         |         |
| Inflation RPI         | 8.30%   | 2.6%    | 2.80%   | 2.80%   |
| Pay Inflation         | 4.50%   | 2.00%   | 2.00%   | 2.00%   |
|                       |         |         |         |         |
| Interest (Receivable) | 1.00%   | 1.00%   | 1.00%   | 1.00%   |
|                       |         |         |         |         |
|                       | 4.68%   | 4.68%   | 4.68%   | 4.68%   |

| Interest (Payable)<br>existing borrowing |       |       |       |       |
|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| Interest (Payable) new<br>borrowing      | 3.38% | 3.38% | 3.38% | 3.38% |

- 2.2 The second interest rate payable line above reflects the revised offer made by Cornwall Council for new loans agreed from April 2019. It should be noted that the rate will only be fixed when loans are taken out and future rates are subject to movement in the general market. Loans that predate April 2019 will continue to be calculated using Cornwall Council's historic consolidated rate of interest.
- 2.3 The proposed budget is set out in Appendix I. The variations between the latest 2022/23 forecast and the proposed 2023/24 budget are listed on page 5 of Appendix I. The 2024/25 to 2026/27 estimates are only indicative.
- 2.4 Some of the more significant items affecting the proposed budgets are as follow:
- 2.5 The **Corporate** cost centre currently shows a favourable movement of £1.686m.
- 2.6 Increasing the tolls by 30% has increased the forecasted income by £1.649m.
- 2.7 By issuing the tag statements electronically instead of being issued via the post is expected to save £0.068m.
- 2.8 Bank charges have seen an increase of £0.037m due to the increase in the tolls.
- 2.9 The **Bridge's** revenue budget makes provision for the ongoing maintenance and operations of the bridge and its infrastructure in line with current engineering practices. The movement from the previous year shows an adverse movement of £0.674m. The main changes from the previous year are:
- 2.9.1 Staffing including agency is showing an increase £0.052m due to pay awards and inflation rises.
- 2.9.2 Bridge and gantry inspections is showing an increase of £0.320m due to the requirements for 2023/24.
- 2.9.3 Energy costs are showing an increase of £0.154m due to rising electricity costs
- 2.9.4 Toll cash handling and collection is showing an increase of £0.057m due to inflation rises.
- 2.9.5 Operational expenses have increased by £0.088m owing to the consumer price index (CPI) estimate of 7.5% for next year.

- 2.10 The **Ferry's** revenue budget also makes a provision for the ongoing maintenance and operation of the ferries and their associated infrastructure in line with current engineering practices. The movement from the previous year shows an adverse increase of £0.529m. The main changes are as follows:
- 2.10.1 Staffing including agency staff is showing an increase of £0.391m due to pay awards, inflation rises and issues recruiting.
- 2.10.2 Repairs & Maintenance (R&M) building and ground maintenance is forecasting a saving of £0.043m.
- 2.10.3 Marine oil has increased by £0.029m
- 2.10.4 The other areas have been hit by inflation rises due to CPI being estimated at 7.5% for 2023/24.
- 2.11 The **Learning Centre** costs has increase by £0.021m, mainly to due to a £0.018m increase in activities.
- 2.12 Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) and Interest repayments have reduced by £0.047m following:
  - Re-profile of £0.125m Bridge LED lighting into 2022/23 and a reduction in costs of £0.125m.
  - Re-profile of £0.900m ferry traffic control systems into 2022/23.
  - Reduction of £1.300m in the Bridge resurfacing and £0.200m re-profiled into 2022/23.
  - Additional £0.400m for Bridge Deck waterproof/drainage.
  - Movement of £0.200m for the Parapet Works into 2022/23 as a future scheme
- 2.13 The proposed Capital Programme is shown in Appendix 2. Work has been undertaken by officers to assess the current capital programme and the revised estimate for 2022/23 is now anticipated at £2.841m, a decrease of £2.059m based on the changes below:
  - Re-profile of £1.500m for Rocker/Pendle remedial works into 23/24
  - Re-profile of £0.900m ferry traffic control systems into 2023/24
  - Reduction of £0.125m Bridge LED lighting
  - Additional £0.400m for toll system updated.
- 2.14 Two indicative future schemes have been added for 2023/24, £0.300m for Torpoint offices and workshops refurbishment and £0.400m for Toll Booth replacement.

2.15 **Reserves** – the reserve position as at 31<sup>st</sup> March (Appendix 3) is shown in the table below:

|   | 2022/23 | 2023/24 | 2024/25   | 2025/26   | 2026/27   |
|---|---------|---------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Forecast reserve<br>surplus / (deficit) |         |         |           |           |           |
| at 31st March                           | £0.614m | £0.192m | (£1.140m) | (£1.664m) | (£2.133m) |

2.16 The Joint Committee receive a quarterly update on its financial position in order to provide assurance that the finances of the undertaking are being managed appropriately and that any significant issues are highlighted and necessary action is taken to address them.

### **Annual Business Plan**

2.17 The Terms of Reference for the Undertaking requires that an Annual Business Plan accompanies the budgets for approval by Full Councils. The 2023/24 Draft Business Plan attached as Appendix 4, is a single year plan recognising that a full review of this process may be required following any feedback from the ongoing consultant's review.

### **3** Benefits for Customers/Residents

3.1 Appropriate management of finances and budget monitoring ensures that appropriate resources are available for the operation, maintenance and improvement of the crossings which form key elements of the local transport network which is essential to the sustainable economic and social development of the region for the benefit of residents.

### 4 Relevant Previous Decisions

- 4.1 Approved budget for 2022/23 at Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee of 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2021 (TBTF/34)
- 4.2 <u>https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s152034/2022%2023%20Revenue%20Estimate</u> <u>s%20and%20Capital%20Programme%20Report.pdf</u>
- 4.3 Approved budget for 2022/23 at Cornwall Council meeting of 22<sup>nd</sup> February 2022 (CC/148)
- 4.4 <u>https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s153916/Tamar%20Bridge%20Torpoint%20Ferr</u> y%202022-23%20Revenue%20Estimates%20and%20Capital%20Programme.pdf
- 4.5 On recommendation of Cabinet meeting of 9<sup>th</sup> February 2022 (CAB/88)

- 4.6 <u>https://democracy.cornwall.gov.uk/documents/s153587/Tamar%20Bridge%20and%20Torpoint</u> %20Ferry%20-%20202223%20Revenue%20Estimates%20and%20Capital%20Programme%20-%20Report.pdf
- 4.7 Approved budget for 2022/23 at City Council meeting of 24 January 2022
- 4.8 https://democracy.plymouth.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?Cld=276&MID=9992
- 4.9 On recommendation of Plymouth City Council Cabinet meeting of 11 January 2022
- 4.10 <u>https://democracy.plymouth.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=254&MID=9715</u>

### 5 Consultation and Engagement

5.1 The Joint Committee receive quarterly updates on the financial position

#### 6 Financial Implications of the proposed course of action/decision

6.1 Financial implications are detailed within Section 2 of this report. Whilst this report only seeks approval of the 2023/24 revenue budget and capital programme, the forecast over the 4 year period includes assumptions and best estimates at the time of preparation. The forecast shows that the reserve will be in deficit early 2024/25, unless alternative funding or income, or reduced expenditure, can be identified.

|   | 2022/23 | 2023/24 | 2024/25   | 2025/26   | 2026/27   |
|---|---------|---------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| Forecast reserve<br>surplus / (deficit) |         |         |           |           |           |
| at 31st March                           | £0.614m | £0.192m | (£1.140m) | (£1.664m) | (£2.133m) |

- 6.2 The Joint Committee will need to consider a range of options to address the deficit reserve position. However, in the event that the reserve is in deficit at the end of a financial year, the Joint Parent Authorities would need to provide revenue support to remedy the deficit. This means that by the end of 2026/27 (based on current assumptions) cumulative revenue support required would be £2.133m (£1.066m from each Parent Authority).
- 6.3 Included in the 2025/26 assumptions is a return to pre-pandemic traffic levels. This will need to be closely monitored over the next 12 months as current recovery has only been around the 90% level (+/- a few percent) of the pre-pandemic traffic levels. It has also been suggested that the United Kingdom will enter an official recession in 2023, and historically when this has happened the Joint Undertaking has seen traffic levels reduce, which would put further pressure on the income budget.

6.4 The global economy is experiencing changes in consumer patterns and inflation at an unprecedented rate. The financial impacts on the Joint Undertaking will be closely monitored by officers. Joint Committee Members will be kept informed through the budget monitoring reports presented at the quarterly Joint Committees in relation to the 2023/24 budget, and the Future Financing Reports in relation to the longer-term position.

### 7 Legal/Governance Implications of the proposed course of action/decision

7.1 The Joint Committee is being asked to make recommendations to the Full Councils of both parent authorities via the Cabinets of both parent authorities. Cornwall Council's Cabinet will consider this at its meeting on 8 February 2023 and Cornwall Council's Full Council will consider this at its meeting on 21 February 2023. Plymouth City Council's Cabinet will consider this at its meeting on 9 February 2023 and Plymouth City Council's Full Council's Full Council's Full Council will consider this at its meeting on 27 February 2023.

### 8 Risk Implications of the proposed course of action/decision

8.1 There are no implications associated with this report.

### 9 Cornwall Development and Decision Wheel

9.1 Not applicable.

### 10 Options available

- 10.1 To approve the proposed revenue estimate for 2023/24, capital programme and draft business plan as set out in Appendices I 4. This is the preferred option for the reasons set out in this report.
- 10.2 To not approve the proposed revenue budget for 2023/24, capital programme and draft business plan as set out in Appendices 1 4. This is not the preferred option as a revenue budget, capital programme and business plan must be set.

### II Supporting Information (Appendices)

- II.I Appendix I: Revenue Estimates for 2023/24 to 2026/27
- 11.2 Appendix 2: Capital Programme 2023/24 to 2026/27
- 11.3 Appendix 3: Reserve Estimates 2023/24 to 2026/27
- 11.4 Appendix 4: Draft Business Plan 2023/24

#### 12 Background Papers

I2.I None

## **I3** Approval and clearance

## 13.1 All reports:

| Final report sign offs  | This report has been<br>cleared by (or mark not<br>required if appropriate) | Date       |
|---|---|------------|
| Governance/Legal  | Lia Musto-Shinton   | 23/11/2022 |
| (Required for <b>all</b> reports)   |   |            |
| Finance   | Geraldine Baker   | 23/11/2022 |
| (Required for <b>all</b> reports)   |   |            |
| Cornwall Development and<br>Decision Wheel (Required for<br><b>all</b> reports) |   |            |
| Service Director  | Vicky Fraser,   | 23/11/2022 |
| (Required for <b>all</b> reports)   | Service Director – Environment<br>and Connectivity                          |            |
| Strategic Director  |   |            |
| (If required)   |   |            |

## Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee 2023-2024 Annual Business Plan

## Contents

| <u>Contents</u>                          |    |
|--|----|
| Message from the Chairmen                | 12 |
| The Context for the Annual Business Plan | 13 |
| Long Term Strategy                       | 13 |
| Meeting Customer Expectations            | 14 |
| Budget Context                           | 16 |
| Performance Targets                      | 18 |
| Table I Safe Services                    | 18 |
| Table 2 Reliable Services                | 19 |
| Monitoring Indicators                    | 21 |

### Message from the Chairmen

This Annual Business Plan extends beyond the last approved four-year Strategic Plan 2018-2022 agreed by the Committee in September 2017.

The Plan represents a continuation of an interim approach whilst the Parent Authorities, the Committee and management consider alternative approaches to business planning during the coming year. The provision of a single year plan ensures continuity whilst a review being undertaken with external assistance is ongoing.

The coming year will be an extremely busy and testing 12 months. The organisation needs to address the stresses caused by the current economic situation, particularly relating to inflation and increased energy costs, and the ongoing effects of the Covid pandemic on our income. The first of three refits will reduce service at Torpoint for a number of weeks in April and early May and major works on the bridge's main cables and articulation elements later in the year will be technically challenging. These projects reflect the Committee's continuing recognition of the need to ensure that the service provided by these essential and strategic crossings, under its control, remains robust and that programmes take a long view in maintaining the key assets.

It is that long view approach that has convinced the Committee to undertake strategic reviews of operational efficiency and the approach to long term business planning.

The Plan demonstrates our ongoing commitment to delivering a safe, reliable and efficient service to our users and it is intended that this document will form the basis of management reports to Members during the course of the year.

A summary of progress made against the Plan will accompany the Annual Report published in draft form in June 2024.

Councillor Martin Worth Joint Chairman Cornwall Council Councillor Jonathan Drean Joint Chairman Plymouth City Counci

## The Context for the Annual Business Plan

## Long Term Strategy

Plans for the longer term sustain the organisation's mission to provide safe, reliable and efficient crossings of the River Tamar. These plans are influenced by the Local Transport Plans of the Joint Authorities.

The physical and financial resources must continue to be available for major tasks such as resurfacing and repainting the Bridge and undertaking refits of the Ferries. Maintenance cycles may span consecutive Business Plan cycles, therefore while the medium-term financial plan spans four years, potential maintenance requirements beyond that period must also be considered within the organisation's general business plans.

The undertaking must maintain a clear strategy for the future to accommodate changes in traffic demand, user expectations, legislation and other factors that may stimulate changes in the way the undertaking operates and may require improvements to facilities. Therefore, potential change beyond the four year period of the medium-term financial plan must also be considered.

## **Continuity with the previous Strategic Framework**

The Strategic Plan that expired in March 2022 contained a number of broad goals for the four-year period April 2018 to March 2022. Those goals remain relevant and are recorded below, with the continuing work to progress each goal. This approach is considered to be the most effective during a period when the organisation is developing new strategic approaches with the assistance of consultants.

Specific actions to achieve the desired outcomes are provided in KPI tables later in the document. These tables will allow Members, users and other stakeholders to monitor the performance of the service.

### Strategic Goal: Meeting Customer Expectations

- Achieve or exceed service delivery KPIs
- providing more payment options for TamarTag customers
- providing a greater range of communication routes online
- undertaking major projects to ensure Bridge and Ferries are maintained to appropriate standards
- proactively communicate with customers
- expand scope and improve detail of traffic data

### Strategic Goal: Fiscally Sustainable

- ensure that income can fund forecast expenditure
- act on an external review of operational efficiency
- routinely report progress and update financial positions
- improve management of toll debtors
- pursue the ability to index-link tolls

### Strategic Goal: Transparent Governance and Clear Decision Making Processes

- consider alternative organisational models within risk and business efficiency consultancies
- adopt a revised approach to long term planning and business planning
- publish additional information and raise awareness of public meetings
- work towards a schedule of Committee meetings in Cornwall in addition to meeting in Plymouth
- consider ways in which the crossings might assist the Parent Authorities in addressing the Climate Emergency
- review legislation and governance

### Strategic Goal: A Modern, Diverse and Well Trained Workforce

- act on workforce feedback and progress any recommendations from external review
- consider ways to mitigate recruitment issues in key specialist posts

### Strategic Goal: Quality and Appropriate Standards

- improve pedestrian safety
- demonstrate our safety culture
- provide assurance about our approach to the environment
- maintain appropriate regulatory standards
- reduce environmental impact and ensure energy use is moderated

## Actions Plan for 2023-24

The following detailed actions to meet the 2023-24 goals:

### **Meeting Customer Expectations**

| ACTION   | Timeframe    | RELATIONSHIP TO<br>PROGRESSING STRATEGIC<br>GOALS              |
|--|--------------|--|
| Provide more flexible Direct<br>Debit scheme for TamarTag<br>customers | Spring 2023  | Providing more payment options for cash and TamarTag customers |
| Expand the proactive customer engagement policy                        | Through 2023 | Proactively communicate with customers                         |

### Fiscally Sustainable

| ACTION                    | Timeframe   | RELATIONSHIP TO<br>PROGRESSING STRATEGIC<br>GOALS         |
|---------------------------|-------------|---|
| Review charging structure | Summer 2023 | Ensure that the crossings remain financially sustainable. |

| Provide budget monitoring<br>reports to Committee with<br>updates to long-term model | Quarterly                                     | Routinely report progress and update financial positions   |
|--|---|--|
| Determine and progress the<br>preferred route to enable<br>index-linking of tolls    | Ongoing                                       | Reduce income risk   |
| Complete an independent<br>efficiency review of the<br>undertaking                   | April 2023, report to<br>Committee, June 2023 | Assurance that best practice is<br>being deployed to ensure that<br>crossings represent value for<br>money |

## Transparent Governance and Clear Decision Making Processes

| ACTION  | Timeframe              | RELATIONSHIP TO<br>PROGRESSING STRATEGIC<br>GOALS                     |
|---|------------------------|---|
| Expand independent publication of information                                 | Ongoing                | Publish additional information and raise awareness of public meetings |
| Undertake review of<br>governance arrangements and<br>consider new frameworks | Through financial year | Effective and transparent corporate oversight and challenge           |

## A Modern, Diverse and Well Trained Workforce

| ACTION  | Timeframe              | RELATIONSHIP TO<br>PROGRESSING STRATEGIC<br>GOALS                  |
|---|------------------------|--|
| Implement recommendations<br>from 2022 employee survey  | Ongoing                | Demonstrate value of workforce<br>feedback                         |
| Review job design when<br>vacancies occur to encourage<br>more flexible working and part-<br>time opportunities | Ongoing                | Continue the actions detailed in<br>Gender Pay Gap Reports         |
| Review Employee Terms and<br>Conditions   | December 2023          | Complete the actions detailed in external reports and action plans |
| Address any organisation issues raised in external reviews  | Through financial year | Review legislation and governance                                  |

## Quality and Appropriate Standards

| ACTION   | Timeframe                               | RELATIONSHIP TO<br>PROGRESSING STRATEGIC<br>GOALS |
|--|---|---|
| Upgrade traffic control systems<br>at Torpoint and Devonport | 2023 (Assumes recruitment of key staff) | Improve pedestrian safety                         |

| Certification of Occupational<br>Health and Safety Management<br>to ISO 45001 Standard | Autumn 2023 | Demonstrate our safety culture                          |
|--|-------------|---|
| Certification of Environmental<br>Management System to<br>ISO14001 Standard            | Autumn 2023 | Provide assurance about our approach to the environment |
| Continue technical inspection programme at Tamar Bridge                                | Ongoing     | Maintaining appropriate regulatory standards            |
| Maintain ferries to classification society standards                                   | Ongoing     | Maintaining appropriate regulatory standards            |

## **Budget Context**

The approved budgets for 2023-2024 are reported below.

Estimated income figures assume that traffic will be affected by major works at the bridge during the year and there is no growth in traffic volumes at Torpoint Ferry.

| Forecast Income   | £s   |
|---|--|
| Toll Revenue (Bridge)<br>Toll Revenue (Ferry)<br>Tag Related Fees<br>Income from Agency Charges<br>Rents & Miscellaneous Income<br>Grant Income<br>Investment Income and Interest                     | 14,211,000<br>1,835,000<br>460,000<br>446,000<br>110,000<br>0<br>0     |
| TOTAL FORECAST REVENUE<br>Forecast Expenditure  | 17,062,000   |
| Bridge Operations & Maintenance<br>Ferry Operations & Maintenance<br>Learning Centre<br>Corporate Expenses<br>Interest Payments (cost of capital funding)<br>Repayment of Capital (Revenue Provision) | 5,431,000<br>6,556,000<br>135,000<br>565,000<br>1,673,000<br>3,124,000 |
| TOTAL FORECAST EXPENDITURE  | 17,484,000   |
| Forecast Deficit for Year   | £422,000   |

### Reserves

The forecast deficit will mean that the reserve maintained as contingency will reduce from a forecast  $\pounds 614,000$  at 31 March 2023 to a forecast  $\pounds 192,000$  at the end of March 2024.

### **Capital Works**

The borrowing required to fund capital works during the year is anticipated to be £10,650,000.

## **Performance Targets**

In addition to the quarterly reports on progress made to the Joint Committee, progress against the measures below will be published on our website.

### Table I Safe Services

| Description  | KPI   | Target   | Why this is important?  |
|--|---|--|---|
| Number of accidents<br>involving members of<br>the public          | Number of<br>reportable<br>incidents and<br>accidents<br>involving the<br>public at both<br>crossings | Zero and<br>maintain   | Public safety is an integral<br>part of our business  |
| Reportable incidents<br>and minor accidents<br>involving employees | Number of<br>reportable<br>incidents and<br>accidents<br>involving<br>employees at<br>both crossings  | Reduce to zero<br>and maintain<br>zero incidents<br>and accidents. | Staff safety is an integral<br>part of our business.<br>Need to mitigate risk to<br>the lowest practicable level<br>to avoid further accidents.                 |
| Lost time – employees  | Days lost due to<br>accidents   | Less than 20 days  | Provides a measure<br>of the safety of the<br>work environment.<br>Reduces costs<br>associated with<br>absence or reduced<br>capability following<br>accidents. |

## Table 2 Reliable Services

| Description                                  | KPI  | Target   | Why this is important?   |
|--|--|--|--|
| Bridge traffic lane<br>availability          | Peak time lane<br>availability<br>Total lane availability  | >99.5%   | Measures success of traffic<br>management and reliability of<br>infrastructure. Ensuring that<br>lanes are open is key to<br>ensuring that journeys are<br>predictable and reduces the |
|  |  | >98.5%   | risk of accidents.   |
| Bridge toll booth<br>availability            | % of scheduled booth<br>hours achieved   | >99%   | In addition to helping to<br>ensure that journey times<br>are predictable, the<br>measure assists assessment<br>of the performance of the<br>contractor                                |
| Ferry scheduled<br>crossings<br>availability | Peak Time<br>scheduled crossings<br>achieved<br>Off-Peak scheduled<br>crossings achieved   | To be confirmed                                  | Measures success of vessel<br>management and reliability<br>of infrastructure. Predictable<br>service is essential for<br>customers to plan the best<br>mode of transport.             |
| Ferry waiting/journey<br>times               | Average journey time<br>from entry of waiting<br>area to exit off ferry<br>Peak journey time<br>from entry of waiting<br>area to exit off ferry        | To be confirmed<br>(system extension<br>pending) | Measures success of vessel<br>management and reliability<br>of infrastructure. Predictable<br>journey times are essential<br>for customers to plan the<br>best mode of transport.      |
| Bridge journey times                         | Average journey time<br>between A38 Carkeel &<br>St Budeaux junctions<br>Peak average journey<br>time between A38<br>Carkeel & St Budeaux<br>junctions | < 5mins 45 sec                                   | Measures success of traffic<br>management and reliability<br>of infrastructure.<br>Predictable journey times<br>are essential for customers<br>to plan the best mode of<br>transport.  |

## Table 3 Effective and Efficient Services

| Description                            | КРІ  | Target   | Why this is important?  |
|--|--|--|---|
| Expenditure                            | Variance<br>against<br>budgets   | Monthly review<br>within 10% of<br>profiled spend                  | Cost control, financial management, efficiency.   |
| Tag Usage                              | Overall usage  | ≈60%   | Maintains plaza capacity.   |
|  | Peak usage   | ≈80%   |   |
| Complaints                             | Response time  | 95% of<br>complaints<br>responded to<br>within 10<br>working days. | Those making complaints<br>remain aware that their<br>comments are valued and<br>investigations are prioritised.            |
| Payment within 30 days of invoice date | % of invoices are<br>paid within 30<br>days                                      | >95%   | Payment within terms assists<br>the relationship with suppliers<br>and improves validity of financial<br>monitoring process |
| Staff sickness absence                 | Days absence<br>per employee<br>per annum  | Average of <9 days   | Reflects a healthy workforce and sound HR practices.  |
| Energy recovered waste incineration    | non-hazardous<br>waste to be<br>diverted from<br>landfill for<br>energy recovery | 60% diversion  | Reduction of waste improves<br>efficiency and demonstrates<br>our concern for the wider                                     |
| Recycled waste                         | non-hazardous<br>waste diverted<br>from landfill to<br>be recycled               | 40% diversion  | community   |

### **Monitoring Indicators**

In addition to the key indicators that measure the organisation's own performance, other indicators can provide information on aspects of service delivery which can by varying degrees be outside the control of the organisation.

The organisation also reports and monitors measurements widely used in the public sector and which are appropriate to report for reasons of transparency.

The indicators shown in the table below will be monitored.

Annual reviews will report the actions that will be taken in the course of the year that are likely to impact on these areas.

| Description  | Monitor Indicators  | Why this is<br>important to<br>service users  | Why a target is not<br>appropriate or<br>measure is partly or<br>wholly outside our<br>control  |
|--|---|---|---|
| Complaints – Number<br>received  | Number  | As an indicator of<br>customer satisfaction   | We wish to expand<br>the ways in which<br>users can<br>communicate issues<br>and encourage<br>feedback. Any<br>target works against<br>this aim |
| Road Traffic Collisions<br>(RTCs) occurring within<br>Joint Committee<br>controlled highway. | No of RTCs within<br>Tamar Bridge/Saltash<br>Tunnel tidal flow<br>system. | We must provide a safe<br>environment to users<br>and ourstaff.   | Many RTCs are due<br>largely to driver error.   |
|  | No of RTCs within<br>Torpoint Ferry traffic<br>control area.              | RTCs impact on service<br>delivery, frequently<br>requiring at least partial<br>closure of access to or<br>from vessels and |   |

| Incidents of recorded<br>anti- social behaviour<br>on Joint Committee<br>property. | Reported incidents at each crossing | Users expect a safe and secure environment | Threatening, anti-social<br>or illegal behaviour is the<br>responsibility of the<br>those performing the<br>act(s). |
|--|-------------------------------------|--|---|
|  |                                     |  |   |

Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry 2023-2024 Business Plan

### Appendix C

### **CORNWALL COUNCIL**

## TAMAR BRIDGE AND TORPOINT FERRY JOINT COMMITTEE

**DRAFT** MINUTES of a Meeting of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee held in the Warspite Room, Plymouth City Council, Armada Way, Plymouth, PLI 3AA on Friday 2 December 2022 commencing at 10.00 am.

| Present:-               | Councillors: Worth (Co-Chair) and Jonathan Drean (Co-Ch<br>(None) |  |
|-------------------------|---|--|
|                         | Mark Coker, Hendy, Long, Tivnan and Toms.                         |  |
| Also in<br>attendance:- | Councillors: Chaz Singh.  |  |
| Apologies for absence:- | Councillors: Donnithorne and Pat Patel.                           |  |

### **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

(Agenda No. 2)

TBTF/15 There were no declarations of interest.

### MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 30 SEPTEMBER 2022

(Agenda No. 3)

TBTF/16 It was moved by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Long, and

**RESOLVED** That the Minutes of the meeting of the Tamar Bridge and Torpoint Ferry Joint Committee held on 30 September 2022 were correctly recorded and that they be signed by the Chairman, subject to the following amendment:- that Councillor Tivnan was also in attendance.

### **PUBLIC QUESTIONS**

(Agenda No. 4)

TBTF/17 There were no questions from the Public.

### **GENERAL MANAGER'S QUARTERLY REPORT**

(Agenda No. 5)

TBTF/18 The Committee considered the General Manager's Quarterly Report (previously circulated), presented by the General Manager.

In response to comments and questions from the Joint Committee Members, Officers advised that:

- 1. Members were advised that any costs cited in the contracts in the report were indexed to inflation and would increase over time.
- 2. Members were informed that replacing fibre glass toll booths would be quicker than refurbishment and although more expensive, the increased longevity of the replacement booths would offset the higher cost implications as well as causing less disruption to the bridge's day to day operations.
- 3. Clarification was sought on whether the decrease in bridge usage was reflected in a similar increase in usage of the A386, details of which would be sought by the General Manager from Devon County Council.
- 4. Concern was expressed that increasing toll rates would contribute to deprivation and would impact the local economy. Members were informed that any specific concerns should be given in writing to the Joint Chairs who would pass them on to our consultants at the next appropriate meeting.
- 5. Members expressed concern that there had been a lack of support for the Tamar Bridge from local Members of Parliament and Government. It was confirmed that Members and officers had written to local Members of Parliament seeking their support, with some responses offering support received. Officers had a meeting with the Department for Transport scheduled for the 13<sup>th</sup> of December 2022.

6. There was general support for an informal meeting between Members and officers to discuss terminology such as, 'the user pays principal'.

It was proposed by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Worth, and

### **RESOLVED** that: -

- I. The report be noted;
- 2. an updated report be brought to the next meeting.

It was further moved and proposed by Councillor Long, seconded by Councillor Coker and

#### **RESOLVED** that:-

3. An informal meeting be arranged between Members and officers to discuss terminology such as, 'the user pays principle'.

### **BUDGET MONITORING 2022/23**

(Agenda No. 6)

TBTF/19 The Committee considered the Budget Monitoring 2022/23 report (previously circulated by the Service Accountant.

In response to comments and questions from Joint Committee Members, Officers confirmed that:-

1. Clarification was sought and given that there was £11.48 million in estimated expenditure and £15.397 million in estimated income. This would give an estimated operating profit of £3.9 million, however CCMRP payments of £4.844 million would create an overall loss of £944,000. Members were informed that CCMRP payments were minimum revenue provision re-payments made to Cornwall Council for loans issued to allow for capital works which has been a contributing factor in the reduction of capital reserves.

It was proposed by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Toms, and

#### **RESOLVED** that:-

That the revenue forecast and capital programme for 2022/23 be noted.

# 2023/24 REVENUE ESTIMATES AND CAPITAL PROGRAMME (AND BUSINESS PLAN) REPORT

(Agenda No. 7)

TBTF/20 The Committee considered the 2023-24 Revenue Estimates and Capital Programme report (previously circulated), presented by the Service Accountant.

In response to comments and questions from Joint Committee Members, Officers confirmed that:-

- 1. Members were informed that by the end of 2024/25 there would be a deficit which was unforeseen at the time of writing due to the adverse economic climate and rising inflation which remained ongoing.
- 2. There was general support for a workshop between officers and Members to discuss in detail the revenue estimates in the new year, followed by a subsequent meeting between National Highways, other partner agencies and Cornish Members of Parliament to discuss the need for support on the maintenance of the Tamar Crossing and the A38.
- 3. Members were informed that recruitment was still an issue and while some vacancies had been filled, there were still remaining vacancies. Agency staff were still being employed but kept to a minimum.
- 4. It was confirmed with Members the break even point for introducing LED street lighting on the Bridge was around 4-5 years.

It was moved by Councillor Coker, seconded by Councillor Long, and

**RESOLVED** that it be recommended to the Councils of the Parent authorities via the Cabinets of the Parent Authorities :-

I. That the 2023/24 revenue estimates and capital programme and the draft 2023/24 Business Plan, as set out in the appendices to this report, be approved;

2. the longer term forecast to 2026/27 is noted; and

It was further moved and proposed by Councillor Drean, seconded by Councillor Coker and

**RESOLVED** that:-

2. That it is recommended there is a Members workshop to look at future financing and financial reserves up to 2026/27 and beyond. Also to subsequently ask National Highways, other partner agencies and Cornish Members of Parliament to attend a meeting to discuss the need for support on the maintenance of the Tamar Crossing and the A38.

The meeting ended at 11.32 am